National COVID-19 Science Task Force (NCS-TF)



Type of document: Assessment on request	
In response to request from: FDHA	Date of request: January 2021
Expert groups involved: Milo Puhan, Roman Stocker, Marcel	
Tanner and Public Health group, with input from multiple	Date of response: 18/1/2020
groups	
Contact person: Milo Puhan	
Comment on planned updates: at the end of January we plan to	have an updated policy brief on the role of children
and adolescents in the transmission of SARS-CoV-2	

Assessment of the Science Task Force mandated by the FDHA (January 2021)

The issue of operating schools in the pandemic is very complex. From kindergarten and primary school through higher education, the risks of transmission of SARS-CoV-2 vary widely, as do educational, social, and health-related (both physical and mental) concerns. To address this complexity, we conducted a scientific assessment that accounts for differences in the epidemiological situation, level of schooling, positive and negative effects of control measures, and confidence in the evidence.

Results are presented below in two tables for each school level: an overview of the relative advantages or disadvantages of particular control measures, depending on the epidemiological situation, as well as a detailed matrix on which the overview is based. The assessments themselves do not constitute recommendations. Consequently, it is not a contradiction if school policy does not align precisely with the scientific assessment of advantages and disadvantages of control measures. Feasibility, acceptance, and other pandemic control measures (apart from schools) must be considered as a whole.

Our findings indicate that there is a wide range of control measures, some of which have been underutilized, and that the choice of measures depends on the epidemiological situation and school level. The <u>Ciao Corona</u> study of 2500 Zurich schoolchildren serves as a guide for decisions regarding additional measures. This study shows that with the package of measures implemented in schools by the end of October (which remain ongoing), outbreaks in schools are uncommon. If the situation worsens, a number of measures can still be implemented in a stepwise manner and coordinated across cantons. (A comprehensive selection can be found <u>here</u>; the tables include various measures.)

It is important to note that owing to the short time available to complete this assessment, not every measure could be definitively assessed and referenced. This document will therefore be further refined after 18/1/2021. Note also that the next version will include control measures for vocational and higher education.

For the convenience of decision-makers, key results of the Science Task Force's overall assessment by school level are presented first. A detailed description of the approach and a detailed analysis of the control measures follow.

The following examples show how to interpret the assessments in the overview:

Advantages Disadvantages	The advantages and disadvantages of a measure are balanced (circle on a balanced scale). Confidence in the evidence is low (red), so the balance of advantages and disadvantages is likely to change with additional evidence.
Advantages Disadvantages	The advantages of a measure slightly outweigh the disadvantages (one circle). Confidence in the evidence is moderate (yellow), so the balance of advantages and disadvantages may change with additional evidence.
Advantages Disadvantages	The disadvantages of a measure moderately outweigh the advantages (two circles). Confidence in the evidence is high (green), so the balance of advantages and disadvantages is unlikely to change with additional evidence.
Advantages Disadvantages	The advantages of a measure strongly outweigh the disadvantages (three circles). Confidence in the evidence is moderate (yellow), so the balance of advantages and disadvantages may change with additional evidence.

	Epidemiological situation in a specific region or canton					
Control measures	Under control	Serious	Very serious			
General measures ^a	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Sick teachers and sick children stay at home	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Masks for teachers	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Masks for pupils ^b	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
No mixing of classes ^c	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Testing and quarantine of close contacts or classes ^d	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Regular testing in schools	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Reduced class size	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Distance learning ^e						
	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			

Overview of advantages and disadvantages of individual control measures for primary schools

Notes

^a General measures: Hand hygiene, no handshaking, teachers keep 1.5 meters distance from pupils, good ventilation, clean toilets and surfaces, outdoor classes, no camps or field trips, no events with non-school personnel (e.g. parents). HEPA filters should be used when adequate ventilation is not possible.

^b The assessment differs slightly between primary school pupils and >12-year-olds because of possible negative effects (see detailed table) in an epidemiological situation under control.

^c This includes no mixing of classes in school; staggered arrival, canteen, and break times; staggered lunchtimes; additional activities and noncontact sports outdoors (possibly with masks); and other control measures, depending on the epidemiological situation.

^d The extent of testing in schools with cases and instructions for quarantine should depend on the epidemiological situation (e.g. whole classes or schools if the situation is very serious, only close contacts when the situation is under control).

^e As distance learning is not possible for all pupils (e.g. lack of infrastructure, no place to study, or other social problems), arrangements should always be made to teach these pupils on-site.

Note for all school levels: Parents may request home schooling to better protect family members at high risk. This topic was deliberately excluded among control measures in the table, because attitudes toward it vary widely and science can make only a very limited contribution. Decision-makers, however, may wish to consider this issue.

Overview of advantages and disadvantages of individual control measures for

secondary level I

	Epidemiological situation in a specific region or canton					
Control measures	Under control	Serious	Very serious			
General measures ^a	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages				
Sick teachers and sick children stay at home	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			
Masks for teachers	Advantages	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Masks for pupils	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
No mixing of classes ^b	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Testing and quarantine of close contacts or classes ^c	Advantages	Advantages	Advantages			
Regular testing in schools	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Reduced class size	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			
Distance learning ^d						
	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages			

Notes

^a General measures: Hand hygiene, no handshaking, teachers keep 1.5 meters distance from pupils, good ventilation, clean toilets and surfaces, outdoor classes, no camps or field trips, no events with non-school personnel (e.g. parents). HEPA filters should be used when adequate ventilation is not possible.

^b This includes no mixing of classes in school; staggered arrival, canteen, and break times; staggered lunchtimes; additional activities and noncontact sports outdoors (possibly with masks); and other control measures, depending on the epidemiological situation.

^c The extent of testing in schools with cases and instructions for quarantine should depend on the epidemiological situation (e.g. whole classes or schools if the situation is very serious, only close contacts when the situation is under control).

^d As distance learning is not possible for all pupils (e.g. lack of infrastructure, no place to study, or other social problems), arrangements should always be made to teach these pupils on-site.

Overview of advantages and disadvantages of individual control measures for

secondary level II

	Epidemiological situation in a specific region or canton					
Control measures	Under control	Very serious				
General measures ^a	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			
Sick teachers and sick children stay at home	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			
Masks for teachers	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			
Masks for pupils	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			
No mixing of classes ^b	Vorteile Nachteile	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			
Testing and quarantine of close contacts or classes ^c	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			
Regular testing in schools	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			
Reduced class size	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			
Distance learning ^d	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages Disadvantages	Advantages			

Notes

^a General measures: Hand hygiene, no handshaking, teachers keep 1.5 meters distance from pupils, good ventilation, clean toilets and surfaces, outdoor classes, no camps or field trips, no events with non-school personnel (e.g. parents). HEPA filters should be used when adequate ventilation is not possible.

^b This includes no mixing of classes in school; staggered arrival, canteen, and break times; staggered lunchtimes; additional activities and noncontact sports outdoors (possibly with masks); and other control measures, depending on the epidemiological situation.

^c The extent of testing in schools with cases and instructions for quarantine should depend on the epidemiological situation (e.g. whole classes or schools if the situation is very serious, only close contacts when the situation is under control).

^d As distance learning is not possible for all pupils (e.g. lack of infrastructure, no place to study, or other social problems), arrangements should always be made to teach these pupils on-site.

Description of the approach to assessing control measures in schools:

- Primary, lower secondary, and upper secondary school levels have been considered separately. This is particularly important for secondary schools. With the transition here to adolescence and young adulthood, these pupils are regarded epidemiologically as adults (see the <u>policy brief on children</u>).
- The same effects were assessed for each control measure and school level, namely, reduction of SARS-CoV-2 transmission as a *positive* consequence of control measures versus impaired learning progress, social development, and mental health as *negative* consequences.
- For reasons of simplicity, we distinguished between three epidemiological situations: "Under control," "Serious," and "Very serious." The epidemiological situation cannot be adequately described by a single indicator (e.g. cases per week per 100,000 inhabitants). Consequently, the situation for a canton as a whole should be assessed using a combination of indicators (e.g. case numbers, change in case numbers, hospitalizations, the value of R_e, development of new mutations), as the Task Force does in its assessment of the epidemiological situation. A situation "Under control" has sporadic outbreaks but no general increase in local transmission (e.g. as was the case in July–August 2020 in many cantons). In a "Serious" situation there is increased local transmission, and in a "Very serious" situation there is both increased local transmission and risk posed by new mutations.
- Evidence available for children and young people outside the school setting is detailed in the <u>policy brief on</u> <u>children</u>. We therefore base transmission assessments on evidence that children and adolescents are being infected at similar rates to adults, and that infectivity is higher in adolescents and young adults (>12 years) than in children, and similar to adults. Moreover, adolescents and young adults have greater mobility and travel farther to school than children.
- We distinguished three levels of confidence in the evidence: low confidence when it is based primarily on expert opinion and no scientific evidence exists; moderate confidence when scientific evidence is available but is contradictory or of low quality, or only indirect evidence from outside the school setting exists; and high confidence when scientific evidence is consistent and of moderate to high quality.

Explanation of symbols used

It is nearly impossible to quantify the relative advantages and disadvantages of the effects of control measures. Consequently, we assessed them using simplified categories. The confidence in the evidence and the balance of advantages and disadvantages are indicated by color coding:

No effect of control measures	0, 0, 0	
Positive effect:		
small	+, +, +	
medium	++, ++, ++	
large	+++, +++, +++	
Negative effect:		Crean, high confidence in avidence
small	-, -, -	Green: high confidence in evidence
medium	,,	Orange: moderate confidence in evidence
large	,,	Red: low confidence in evidence
Advantages and disadvantages are balanced	●, ●, ●	
Advantages outweigh disadvantages or vice		
versa:		
slightly	●, ●, ●	
moderately	••, ••, ••	
strongly	•••, •••, •••	

Detailed analysis for primary schools

Measures	Epidemiological	-			Negative effects on			
	situation	Community / Region	Families	Learning progress	Social development	Mental health	advantages and disadvantages	
General measures a	Under control	+	0				Advantage •	
	Serious	++	+	0	0	0	Advantage ••	
	Very serious	+++	++				Advantage •••	
Sick teachers and sick	Under control	+	+				Advantage 😐	
children stay at home	Serious	++	++	0	0	0	Advantage ••	
	Very serious	+++	+++				Advantage •••	
Masks for teachers	Under control	+	0				•	
	Serious	++	+	-	0	0	Advantage 🔸	
	Very serious	++	++				Advantage 🔸	
Masks for pupils	Under control	0	0				•	
	Serious	+	+	-	-	-	Advantage 🔸	
	Very serious	++	++				Advantage 😐	
No mixing of classes ^b	Under control	0	0				•	
	Serious	+	0	0	-	0	•	
	Very serious	++	+				Advantage 🗕	
Testing and quarantine	Under control	+	+	0	0	0	Advantage 😐	
of close contacts or	Serious	++	+	0	0	0	Advantage ••	
classes ^c	Very serious	+++	+	_ d	_ d	_ d	Advantage 🔸	
Regular testing in	Under control	0	0				•	
schools	Serious	+	+	0	0	0	Advantage 🔸	
	Very serious	+	+				Advantage 🔸	
Reduced class size	Under control	0	0				•	
	Serious	0	0	0	-	0	•	
	Very serious	+	+				Advantage 🔸	
Distance learning	Under control	0	0				Disadvantages ••	
	Serious	+	+			-	Disadvantages ••	
	Very serious	++	++				•	

Notes

^a General measures: Hand hygiene, no handshaking, teachers keep 1.5 meters distance from pupils, good ventilation, clean toilets and surfaces, outdoor classes, no camps or field trips, no events with non-school personnel (e.g. parents). HEPA filters should be used when adequate, regular ventilation is not possible.

^b This includes no mixing of classes in school, staggered arrivals and breaks, staggered lunchtimes, and other measures depending on the epidemiological situation. Additional activities and sports may be held as long as there is no mixing of classes.

^c The extent of testing in schools with cases and instructions for quarantine should depend on the epidemiological situation (e.g. whole classes or schools if the situation is very serious, only close contacts when the situation is under control).

^d Very serious situations may lead to repeated quarantines, which can have negative effects.

Detailed analysis for secondary level I

Measures	Epidemiological situation	Reduced transmission in			Balance of		
	situation	Community / Region	Families	Learning progress	Social development	Mental health	advantages and disadvantages
General measures ^a	Under control	+	0				Advantage •
	Serious	++	+	0	0	0	Advantage ••
	Very serious	+++	++				Advantage •••
Sick teachers and sick	Under control	+	+				Advantage 🔸
children stay at home	Serious	++	++	0	0	0	Advantage 🔸
	Very serious	+++	+++				Advantage •••
Masks for teachers	Under control	+	0				Advantage 🔸
	Serious	++	+	0	0	0	Advantage 🔸
	Very serious	++	++				Advantage 🔸
Masks for pupils	Under control	0	0				•
	Serious	+	+	0	0	0	Advantage 😐
	Very serious	++	++				Advantage 😐
No mixing of classes ^b	Under control	0	0				•
	Serious	+	0	0	0	0	Advantage 😐
	Very serious	++	+				Advantage 😐
Testing and quarantine of	Under control	+	+	0	0	0	Advantage •
close contacts or classes ^c	Serious	++	+	0	0	0	Advantage ••
	Very serious	+++	+	_ d	_ d	_ d	Disadvantage
Regular testing in schools	Under control	0	0				•
	Serious	+	+	0	0	0	Advantage 🗕
	Very serious	+	+				Advantage •
Reduced class size	Under control	0	0				•
	Serious	0	0	0	0	0	•
	Very serious	+	+				Advantage 🗕
Distance learning	Under control	0	0				Disadvantages ••
-	Serious	+	+		_	-	•
	Very serious	++	++				Advantage 🗕

Notes

^a General measures: Hand hygiene, no handshaking, teachers keep 1.5 meters distance from pupils, good ventilation, clean toilets and surfaces, outdoor classes, no camps or field trips, no events with non-school personnel (e.g. parents). HEPA filters should be used when adequate, regular ventilation is not possible.

^b This includes no mixing of classes at school, staggered arrivals and breaks, staggered lunchtimes, and other measures depending on the epidemiological situation. Additional activities and sports may be held as long as there is no mixing of classes.

^c The extent of testing in schools with cases and instructions for quarantine should depend on the epidemiological situation (e.g. whole classes or schools if the situation is very serious, only close contacts when the situation is under control).

^d Very serious situations may lead to repeated quarantines, which can have negative effects.

Detailed analysis for secondary level II

Measures	Epidemiological situation	Reduced trans	mission in	Negative effects on			Balance of advantages and
	situation	Community / Region	Families	Learning progress	Social development	Mental health	disadvantages and
General measures ^a	Under control	+	0				Advantage •
	Serious	++	+	0	0	0	Advantage ••
	Very serious	+++	++				Advantage •••
Sick teachers and sick	Under control	+	+				Advantage •
children stay at home	Serious	++	++	0	0	0	Advantage 🔸
	Very serious	+++	+++				Advantage •••
Masks for teachers	Under control	+	0				Advantage 😐
	Serious	++	+	0	0	0	Advantage 🔸
	Very serious	++	++				Advantage 🔸
Masks for pupils	Under control	0	0				•
	Serious	+	+	0	0	0	Advantage 🗕
	Very serious	++	++				Advantage 🔸
No mixing of classes ^b	Under control	0	0				•
	Serious	+	0	0	0	0	Advantage 🗕
	Very serious	++	+				Advantage 🔸
Testing and quarantine of	Under control	+	+	0	0	0	Advantage 🗕
close contacts or classes ^c	Serious	++	+	0	0	0	Advantage 🔸
	Very serious	+++	+	_ d	_ d	_ d	Advantage •••
Regular testing in schools	Under control	0	0				•
	Serious	+	+	0	0	0	Advantage 🗕
	Very serious	+	+				Advantage 🗕
Reduced class size	Under control	0	0			•	•
	Serious	0	0	0	0	0	•
	Very serious	+	+				Advantage 😐
Distance learning	Under control	0	0				Disadvantage •
	Serious	+	+	_ e	_	-	Advantage 🗕
	Very serious	++	++				Advantage ••

Notes

^a General measures: Hand hygiene, no handshaking, teachers keep 1.5 meters distance from pupils, good ventilation, clean toilets and surfaces, outdoor classes, no camps or field trips, no events with non-school personnel (e.g. parents). HEPA filters should be used when adequate ventilation is not possible.

^b This includes no mixing of classes at school, staggered arrivals and breaks, staggered lunchtimes, and other measures depending on the epidemiological situation. Additional activities and sports may be held as long as there is no mixing of classes.

^c The extent of testing in schools with cases and instructions for quarantine should depend on the epidemiological situation (e.g. whole classes or schools if the situation is very serious, only close contacts when the situation is under control).

^d Very serious situations may lead to repeated quarantines, which can have negative effects.

^e A slightly smaller negative effect can be assumed for gymnasiums than at secondary level I.

References on SARS-CoV-2 and schools

General reviews and recommendations

ECDC review from 12/2020 (includes description of a wide range of mitigation measures in European countries) ¹ CDC recommendations ² Review in school guidelines in other countries ³ Risk reduction in schools, Harvard School of Public Health ⁴ Transmission clusters review (few schools among clusters) ⁵

Transmission in households and schools

Viner review ⁶ Madewell review ⁷ Krishnaratne ⁸ Hyde ⁹ Individual studies ^{10–12}

Case studies on outbreaks

Outbreaks in camps ¹³ Outbreak in Israel, ¹⁴ Chile, ¹⁵ France ¹⁶ Sweden ¹⁷ New Zealand ¹⁸

Contact tracing, overall prevalence, and modeling effect of closure on incidence

UK ¹⁹ Germany ²⁰ Italy ²¹ Ireland ²² Australia ²³ Singapore ²⁴ US ^{25–27} South Korea ^{28,29} Japan ³⁰ Finland ³¹ Netherlands ³²

Specific measures in schools

In-person learning not associated with increased cases in US ³³ Preprints of modeling effect of specific school NPIs in US ^{34,35} Modeling: reopening with reduction of contacts is safe ³⁶

Other important studies

Gargle study in Austria ³⁷ Point-prevalence monitoring studies in UK (includes children and schools) ^{38,39} Ecological studies of NPI effect ^{40–43} Modeling of UK tiered lockdown and school closures ⁴⁴

Impact of school closures

UNESCO position ⁴⁵ European Commission brief on educational inequalities ⁴⁶ Modeling of lifetime impact in US ^{47,48} Maltreatment and domestic violence ^{49,50} Mental health (see references in this article) ⁵¹ Academic achievement ^{48,52} Comments and reviews ⁵³ Social and economic impact ⁵⁴ Downstream effects ⁵⁵ Risk of obesity, ⁵⁶ physical inactivity, sleep ^{57,58}

- 1 COVID-19 in children and the role of school settings in transmission first update. https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/publications-data/children-and-school-settings-covid-19transmission#no-link (accessed Jan 16, 2021).
- 2 Operating schools during COVID-19: CDC's Considerations | CDC. https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/community/schoolschildcare/schools.html?CDC_AA_refVal=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.cdc.gov%2Fcoronavirus%2F2 019-ncov%2Fcommunity%2Fschools-childcare%2Fguidance-for-schools.html (accessed Jan 16, 2021).
- 2 Lo Moro G, Sinigaglia T, Bert F, Savatteri A, Gualano MR, Siliquini R. Reopening schools during the COVID-19 pandemic: overview and rapid systematic review of guidelines and recommendations on preventive measures and the management of cases. *Int J Environ Res Public Health* 2020; **17**: 8839.
- Jones E, Young A, Clevenger K, et al. Healthy schools: risk reduction strategies for reopening schools.
 https://www.cfsd16.org/application/files/1915/9583/7583/Risk_Reduction_Strategies_for_R eopening Schools Harvard.pdf.
- Leclerc QJ, Fuller NM, Knight LE, Funk S, Knight GM. What settings have been linked to SARS-CoV-2 transmission clusters? *Wellcome Open Res* 2020; 5.
 DOI:10.12688/wellcomeopenres.15889.2.
- 6 Viner RM, Mytton OT, Bonell C, *et al.* Susceptibility to SARS-CoV-2 Infection among children and adolescents compared with adults. *JAMA Pediatr* 2020; published online Sept 25. DOI:10.1001/jamapediatrics.2020.4573.
- 7 Madewell ZJ, Yang Y, Longini IM, Halloran ME, Dean NE. Household transmission of SARS-CoV-2. *JAMA Netw Open* 2020; **3**: e2031756.
- 8 Krishnaratne S, Pfadenhauer LM, Coenen M, *et al.* Measures implemented in the school setting to contain the COVID-19 pandemic: a rapid scoping review. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2020; published online Dec 17. DOI:10.1002/14651858.CD013812.
- 9 Hyde Z. COVID-19, children and schools: overlooked and at risk. *Med J Aust* 2020; **213**: 444-446.e1.
- 10 Grijalva CG, Rolfes MA, Zhu Y, *et al.* Transmission of SARS-COV-2 Infections in households Tennessee and Wisconsin, April–September 2020. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* 2020; **69**. DOI:10.15585/mmwr.mm6944e1.
- 11 Park Y, Choe Y, Park O, *et al.* Contact tracing during coronavirus disease outbreak, South Korea, 2020. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2020; **26**. DOI:10.3201/EID2610.201315.
- 12 Somekh E, Gleyzer A, Heller E, *et al.* The role of children in the dynamics of intra family coronavirus 2019 spread in densely populated area. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 2020; **39**: e202–4.

- Szablewski CM, Chang KT, Brown MM, et al. SARS-CoV-2 Transmission and infection among attendees of an overnight camp Georgia, June 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2020;
 69: 1023–5.
- 14 Stein-Zamir C, Abramson N, Shoob H, *et al.* A large COVID-19 outbreak in a high school 10 days after schools' reopening, Israel, May 2020. *Eurosurveillance* 2020; **25**: 2001352.
- 15 Torres JP, Piñera C, De La Maza V, *et al.* Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 antibody prevalence in blood in a large school community subject to a coronavirus disease 2019 outbreak: a cross-sectional study. *Clin Infect Dis* 2020; published online July 10. DOI:10.1093/cid/ciaa955.
- 16 Fontanet A, Tondeur L, Madec Y, *et al.* Cluster of COVID-19 in northern France: a retrospective closed cohort study. *SSRN Electron J* 2020; DOI:10.1101/2020.04.18.20071134.
- 17 Vogel G. How Sweden wasted a 'rare opportunity' to study coronavirus in schools. *Science* (80-) 2020; published online May 22. DOI:10.1126/science.abc9565.
- 18 COVID-19: Current cases | Ministry of Health NZ. https://www.health.govt.nz/ourwork/diseases-and-conditions/covid-19-novel-coronavirus/covid-19-data-andstatistics/covid-19-current-cases (accessed Jan 16, 2021).
- 19 Ismail SA, Saliba V, Bernal JL, Ramsay ME, Ladhani SN. SARS-CoV-2 infection and transmission in educational settings: a prospective, cross-sectional analysis of infection clusters and outbreaks in England. *Lancet Infect Dis*; 2020. DOI:10.1016/S1473-3099(20)30882-3.
- 20 Otte im Kampe E, Lehfeld A-S, Buda S, Buchholz U, Haas W. Surveillance of COVID-19 school outbreaks, Germany, March to August 2020. *Eurosurveillance* 2020; **25**: 2001645.
- 21 Larosa E, Djuric O, Cassinadri M, *et al.* Secondary transmission of COVID-19 in preschool and school settings in northern Italy after their reopening in September 2020: a population-based study. *Eurosurveillance* 2020; **25**: 2001911.
- Heavey L, Casey G, Kelly C, Kelly D, McDarby G. No evidence of secondary transmission of COVID-19 from children attending school in Ireland, 2020. *Eurosurveillance* 2020; 25: 2000903.
- Macartney K, Quinn HE, Pillsbury AJ, *et al.* Transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in Australian educational settings: a prospective cohort study. *Lancet Child Adolesc Heal* 2020; 0. DOI:10.1016/s2352-4642(20)30251-0.
- 24 Yung CF, Kam K, Nadua KD, *et al.* Novel coronavirus 2019 transmission risk in educational settings. *Clin Infect Dis* 2020; published online June 25. DOI:10.1093/cid/ciaa794.
- Link-Gelles R, DellaGrotta AL, Molina C, *et al.* Limited secondary transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in child care programs Rhode Island, June 1–July 31, 2020. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* 2020; 69: 1170–2.
- 26 Gilliam WS, Malik AA, Shafiq M, *et al.* COVID-19 Transmission in US child care programs. *Pediatrics* 2021; **147**: e2020031971.
- 27 Bayham J, Fenichel EP. Impact of school closures for COVID-19 on the US health-care workforce and net mortality: a modelling study. *Lancet Public Heal* 2020; **5**: e271–8.
- 28 Yoon Y, Kim KR, Park H, Kim S, Kim YJ. Stepwise school opening and an impact on the epidemiology of COVID-19 in the children. *J Korean Med Sci* 2020; **35**. DOI:10.3346/JKMS.2020.35.E414.
- 29 Kim J, Choe YJ, Lee J, *et al.* Role of children in household transmission of COVID-19. *Arch Dis Child* 2020: 1–3.
- Iwata K, Doi A, Miyakoshi C. Was school closure effective in mitigating coronavirus disease
 2019 (COVID-19)? Time series analysis using Bayesian inference. Int J Infect Dis 2020; 99: 57–61.
- 31 Kuitunen I, Haapanen M, Artama M, Renko M. Closing Finnish schools and day care centres had a greater impact on primary care than secondary care emergency department visits. *Acta*

Paediatr 2020: apa.15646.

- 32 Rozhnova G, Van Dorp CH, Bruijning-Verhagen P, *et al.* Model-based evaluation of schooland non-school-related measures to control the COVID-19 pandemic. *medRxiv* 2020. DOI:10.1101/2020.12.07.20245506.
- 33 Leidman E, Duca LM, Omura JD, Proia K, Stephens JW, Sauber-Schatz EK. COVID-19 Trends among persons aged 0–24 years — United States, March 1–December 12, 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2021; 70. DOI:10.15585/mmwr.mm7003e1.
- Landeros A, Ji X, Lange KL, *et al.* An examination of school reopening strategies during the SARS-CoV-2 pandemic. *medRxiv* 2020. DOI:10.1101/2020.08.05.20169086.
- Bershteyn A, Kim H-Y, Mcgillen J, Scott Braithwaite R. Which policies most effectively reduce SARS-CoV-2 transmission in schools? *medRxiv* 2020. DOI:10.1101/2020.11.24.20237305.
- 36 Lee B, Hanley JP, Nowak S, Bates JHT, Hébert-Dufresne L. Modeling the impact of school reopening on SARS-CoV-2 transmission using contact structure data from Shanghai. *BMC Public Health* 2020; **20**: 1713.
- 37 Willeit P, Krause R, Lamprecht B, *et al.* Prevalence of RT-PCR-detected SARS-CoV-2 infection at schools: first results from the Austrian School-SARS-CoV-2 Study. *medRxiv* 2021. DOI:10.1101/2021.01.05.20248952.
- Riley S, Walters CE, Wang H, et al. REACT-1 round 7 updated report: regional heterogeneity in changes in prevalence of SARS-CoV-2 infection during the second national COVID-19 lockdown in England. medRxiv 2020. DOI:10.1101/2020.12.15.20248244.
- 39 COVID-19 Schools Infection Survey Round 1, England Office for National Statistics. https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/healthandsocialcare/conditionsan ddiseases/bulletins/covid19schoolsinfectionsurveyround1england/november2020 (accessed Dec 19, 2020).
- 40 Islam N, Sharp SJ, Chowell G, *et al.* Physical distancing interventions and incidence of coronavirus disease 2019: Natural experiment in 149 countries. *BMJ* 2020; **370**: 2743.
- 41 Flaxman S, Mishra S, Gandy A, *et al.* Estimating the effects of non-pharmaceutical interventions on COVID-19 in Europe. *Nature* 2020; **584**: 257–61.
- 42 Haug N, Geyrhofer L, Londei A, *et al.* Ranking the effectiveness of worldwide COVID-19 government interventions. *Nat Hum Behav* 2020; **4**: 1303–12.
- 43 Auger KA, Shah SS, Richardson T, *et al.* Association between statewide school closure and COVID-19 incidence and mortality in the US. *JAMA* 2020; **324**: 859.
- 44 Davies NG, Barnard RC, Jarvis CI, *et al.* Association of tiered restrictions and a second lockdown with COVID-19 deaths and hospital admissions in England: a modelling study. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2020. DOI:10.1016/s1473-3099(20)30984-1.
- 45 UNESCO. School closures caused by Coronavirus (Covid-19). 2020. https://en.unesco.org/covid19/educationresponse (accessed Dec 19, 2020).
- Educational inequalities in Europe and physical school closures during Covid-19 *.
 https://ec.europa.eu/jrc/en/research/crosscutting-activities/fairness. (accessed Jan 16, 2021).
- 47 Christakis DA, Van Cleve W, Zimmerman FJ. Estimation of US children's educational attainment and years of life lost associated with primary school closures during the coronavirus disease 2019 pandemic. *JAMA Netw Open* 2020; **3**: e2028786.
- 48 Achievement gap and coronavirus | McKinsey. https://www.mckinsey.com/industries/publicand-social-sector/our-insights/covid-19-and-pupil-learning-in-the-united-states-the-hurtcould-last-a-lifetime (accessed Jan 16, 2021).
- 49 Cluver L, Lachman JM, Sherr L, *et al.* Parenting in a time of COVID-19. Lancet. 2020; **395**: e64.
- 50 Baron EJ, Goldstein EG, Wallace CT. Suffering in silence: How COVID- 19 school closures inhibit the reporting of child maltreatment. *J Public Econ* 2020; **190**: 104258.

- 51 Janssen LHC, Kullberg M-LJ, Verkuil B, *et al.* Does the COVID-19 pandemic impact parents' and adolescents' well-being? An EMA-study on daily affect and parenting. *PLoS One* 2020; **15**: e0240962.
- 52 Kuhfeld M, Soland J, Tarasawa B, Johnson A, Ruzek E, Liu J. Projecting the Potential Impact of COVID-19 School Closures on Academic Achievement. *Educ Res* 2020; **49**: 549–65.
- 53 Wang G, Zhang Y, Zhao J, Zhang J, Jiang F. Mitigate the effects of home confinement on children during the COVID-19 outbreak. Lancet. 2020; **395**: 945–7.
- 54 Chen WC, Huang AS, Chuang JH, Chiu CC, Kuo HS. Social and economic impact of school closure resulting from pandemic influenza A/H1N1. *J Infect* 2011; **62**: 200–3.
- 55 Thomas J, Kneale D, O'Mara-Eves A, Rees R. School closure in response to epidemic outbreaks: Systems-based logic model of downstream impacts. *F1000Research* 2020; **9**. DOI:10.12688/f1000research.23631.1.
- 56 Rundle AG, Park Y, Herbstman JB, Kinsey EW, Wang YC. COVID-19–related school closings and risk of weight gain among children. Obesity. 2020; **28**: 1008–9.
- 57 Weaver RG, Beets MW, Perry M, *et al.* Changes in children's sleep and physical activity during a 1-week versus a 3-week break from school: a natural experiment. *Sleep* 2019; **42**. DOI:10.1093/sleep/zsy205.
- 58 Moore SA, Faulkner G, Rhodes RE, *et al.* Impact of the COVID-19 virus outbreak on movement and play behaviours of Canadian children and youth: a national survey. *Int J Behav Nutr Phys Act* 2020; **17**: 85.

Evidence from Switzerland

Studies in schools

Ciao Corona Testing in summer ¹ Ciao Corona Testing in Autumn ² Ciao Corona Acute testing in Autumn ³

Studies in households, random samples

Geneva study ⁴ Geneva study – household transmission less likely from children ⁵ Contact tracing in families with children ⁶

Testing criteria for children

BAG⁷

Other

Learning outcomes – worse in primary than secondary schools and individual variation ⁸ Survey on compliance with NPI in young people (largely compliant) ⁹

- 1 Ulyte A, Radtke T, Abela IA, *et al.* Variation in SARS-CoV-2 seroprevalence in school-children across districts, schools and classes. *medRxiv* 2020. DOI:10.1101/2020.09.18.20191254.
- 2 Ulyte A, Radtke T, Abela IA, *et al.* Clustering and longitudinal change in SARS-CoV-2 seroprevalence in school-children: prospective cohort study of 55 schools in Switzerland. *medRxiv* 2020. DOI:10.1101/2020.12.19.20248513.
- 3 Kriemler S, Ulyte A, Ammann P, *et al.* Surveillance of acute SARS-CoV-2 infections in school children and point-prevalence during a time of high community transmission in Switzerland. *medRxiv* 2020. DOI:10.1101/2020.12.24.20248558.

- Stringhini S, Wisniak A, Piumatti G, *et al.* Seroprevalence of anti-SARS-CoV-2 IgG antibodies in Geneva, Switzerland (SEROCoV-POP): a population-based study. *Lancet* 2020.
 DOI:10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31304-0.
- 5 Bi Q, Lessler J, Eckerle I, Lauer SA, Kaiser L. Household transmission of SARS-COV-2: insights from a population-based serological survey. *Silvia Stringhini* 2020; **10**: 12.
- 6 Posfay-Barbe KM, Wagner N, Gauthey M, *et al.* COVID-19 in children and the dynamics of infection in families. *Pediatrics* 2020; **146**. DOI:10.1542/peds.2020-1576.
- 7 Bundesamt für Gesundheit. Testkriterien Kinder. https://www.bag.admin.ch/dam/bag/de/dokumente/mt/k-und-i/aktuelle-ausbruechepandemien/2019-nCoV/testkriterien-kinder.pdf.download.pdf/Testkriterien_Kinder.pdf (accessed Jan 16, 2021).
- 8 Tomasik MJ, Helbling LA, Moser U. Educational gains of in-person vs. distance learning in primary and secondary schools: a natural experiment during the COVID-19 pandemic school closures in Switzerland. *Int J Psychol* 2020. DOI:10.1002/ijop.12728.
- 9 Nivette A, Ribeaud D, Murray A, *et al.* Non-compliance with COVID-19-related public health measures among young adults in Switzerland: Insights from a longitudinal cohort study. *Soc Sci Med* 2021; **268**: 113370.